This Transcript has not been proof read or corrected. It is a working tool for the Tribunal for use in preparing its judgment. It will be placed on the Tribunal Website for readers to see how matters were conducted at the public hearing of these proceedings and is not to be relied on or cited in the context of any other proceedings. The Tribunal's judgment in this matter will be the final and definitive record.

# IN THE COMPETITION APPEAL TRIBUNAL

Case No. 1152/8/3/10 (IR)

Victoria House, Bloomsbury Place, London WC1A 2EB

28<sup>th</sup> April 2010

# Before: THE HON. MR JUSTICE GERALD BARLING (President)

Sitting as a Tribunal in England and Wales

**BETWEEN**:

#### BRITISH SKY BROADCASTING LIMITED

**Proposed Appellant** 

- v —

#### OFFICE OF COMMUNICATIONS

**Proposed Respondent** 

- supported by

# BRITISH TELECOMMUNICATIONS PLC TOP UP TV EUROPE LIMITED VIRGIN MEDIA, INC

**Proposed Interveners** 

Transcribed from tape by Beverley F. Nunnery & Co.
Official Shorthand Writers and Tape Transcribers
Quality House, Quality Court, Chancery Lane, London WC2A 1HP
Tel: 020 7831 5627 Fax: 020 7831 7737
(info@beverleynunnery.com)

## **HEARING**

APPLICATION FOR INTERIM RELIEF

### **APPEARANCES**

- Mr. James Flynn QC and Mr. Meredith Pickford (instructed by Herbert Smith LLP) appeared for the Proposed Appellant.
- <u>Miss Dinah Rose QC</u> and <u>Mr. Josh Holmes</u> and <u>Mr. Ben Lask</u> (instructed by the Office of Communications) appeared for the Proposed Respondent.
- Mr. Mark Hoskins QC and Mr. Gerard Rothschild (instructed by Ashurst LLP) appeared for the Proposed Interveners Virgin Media.
- Mr. David Anderson QC and Miss Sarah Ford and Miss Sarah Love (instructed by BT Legal) appeared for the Proposed Interveners British Telecommunications PLC.
- Mr. Daniel Beard (instructed by Milbank, Tweed, Hadley & McCloy LLP) appeared for the Proposed Intervener Top Up TV.
- Mr. Keith Jones (of Baker McKenzie) appeared for the Proposed Intervener Orange Personal Communications Services Limited.
- Ms Maya Lester (instructed by DLA Piper UK LLP) appeared for the Proposed Intervener Football Association Premier League.

THE PRESIDENT: Good afternoon again, people have been very busy by the look of it. I have
glanced at the various drafts. I cannot pretend that I have homed in on exactly where the
tissue paper needs to be inserted.
MR. FLYNN: Sir, perhaps I could just say, first of all, that the court is in open session, and it has
been suggested that we should actually go into, as it were, commercial in Camera, not
confidentiality ring, but business people. That has been suggested to me. There are
journalists in the room, and that is the position that has just been suggested to me by my
learned friends.
THE PRESIDENT: So everyone says it should be in Camera. By "business people", you mean
clients?
MR. FLYNN: Yes.
THE PRESIDENT: Very well, I think so in these circumstances, as the matters being discussed
are somewhat delicate inevitably at this stage. Clients should remain but everyone else
should leave. Thank you very much. We will tell you as soon as possible when it is
appropriate to go back into open court.
(For proceedings in Private, see separate transcript)