

Case No: 1404/7/7/21

# IN THE COMPETITION APPEAL TRIBUNAL

BETWEEN:

# DAVID COURTNEY BOYLE AND EDWARD JOHN VERMEER

Applicants/Proposed Joint Class Representative

- V -

# GOVIA THAMESLINK LIMITED THE GO-AHEAD GROUP PLC KEOLIS (UK) LIMITED

Respondents/Proposed Defendants

- and -

# SECRETARY OF STATE FOR TRANSPORT

Proposed Interveners

# **CONFIDENTIALITY RING ORDER**

**UPON** reading the correspondence from the legal representatives of all the Parties to these proposed proceedings relating to the establishment of a confidentiality ring by consent

**AND UPON** hearing Counsel for the parties at a case management conference held on 16 December 2021

**AND HAVING REGARD TO** the Tribunal's powers under the Competition Appeal Tribunal Rules 2015 (the "**Tribunal Rules**")

AND UPON the Parties having agreed to the terms of this Order

#### IT IS ORDERED BY CONSENT THAT:

- 1. For the purposes of this Order:
  - 1.1. "Confidential Information" means the material contained in the Relevant Documents in respect of which a claim of confidentiality is agreed or has been or will be made to the Tribunal by a Party pursuant to Rule 99 and/or Rule 101 of the Tribunal Rules.
  - 1.2. "Confidentiality Ring" means all the Relevant Advisers.
  - 1.3. "Relevant Advisers" are those persons:
    - 1.3.1. whose admission to the Confidentiality Ring has received the consent of the Parties pursuant to paragraph 6(1) below or has been authorised by the Tribunal pursuant to paragraph 6(2) below; and
    - 1.3.2. who have given a signed undertaking to the Tribunal in the terms of the Schedule to this Order, of which a copy has been provided to the Tribunal.
  - 1.4. "**Relevant Documents**" means all pleadings and other documents served by any of the Parties.
- 2. Each of the Parties shall (as and when disclosure is required) hereafter disclose to the other parties Relevant Documents containing Confidential Information on the condition that such un-redacted versions and any Confidential Information contained therein shall be disclosed only to the Relevant Advisers, who shall treat such documents in accordance with the terms of the undertaking each of them has given.
- 3. Any such Relevant Document that a party considers to contain Confidential Information shall be marked so as to indicate the parts in relation to which confidential treatment is claimed, in the manner referred to in paragraph 7.46 of the Tribunal's Guide to Proceedings 2015.

- 4. The Relevant Documents are to be used by the Relevant Advisers only for the purposes of these proceedings. The subsequent use of any Relevant Document provided in the course of these proceedings for any other purpose by the receiving Party is prohibited.
- Membership of the Confidentiality Ring becomes effective upon the receipt by the Tribunal of the Relevant Adviser's signed undertaking.
- 6. If any Party wishes to add any person as a Relevant Adviser for the purpose of this Order, they may either:
  - 6.1. obtain the written consent of each of the other Parties to the admission of that individual to the Confidentiality Ring and inform the Tribunal in writing accordingly (copying the representatives of the other Parties); or
  - 6.2. apply to the Tribunal for an order authorising the admission of that individual to the Confidentiality Ring.
- 7. If any Party wishes one of its Relevant Advisers to be removed from the Confidentiality Ring, they shall inform the Tribunal in writing (copying the representatives of the other Parties).
- 8. When a Relevant Adviser is admitted to or removed from the Confidentiality Ring the relevant Party will provide to the Tribunal an up-to-date list of the membership of the Confidentiality Ring.
- 9. With the exception of solicitors' or counsels' notes, and to the extent permitted by law or any applicable professional conduct regulations, copies of all or any (as appropriate) Confidential Information disclosed pursuant to this Order (in both hard and soft copy) must be destroyed insofar as is technologically possible or made inaccessible at the conclusion of these proceedings, or when a Relevant Adviser ceases to be involved in these proceedings. Each Party shall notify the other Parties that the Confidential Information has been destroyed:

9.1. at the conclusion of these proceedings;

- 9.2. when a Relevant Adviser ceases to be involved in these proceedings; and/or
- 9.3. if it is ordered that all or any (as appropriate) of the Confidential Information is no longer relevant to and/or disclosable in these proceedings.
- 10. For the avoidance of doubt, in the event of any anticipated or actual breach of this Order, any Party may seek to enforce the terms of this Order.
- 11. The Parties shall make available without charge to any person on request an up-todate list of the members of the Confidentiality Ring.

12. Costs be reserved.

13. There be liberty to apply.

**The Hon Mr Justice Marcus Smith** President of the Competition Appeal Tribunal Made: 16 December 2021 Drawn: 21 December 2021

## **SCHEDULE**

# PART A

This Part contains the names, for each party, of the Relevant Advisers for the purposes of this Order:

#### Mr Boyle and Mr Vermeer

#### **Solicitors**

- 1. Julian Maitland-Walker
- 2. Adrian Render
- 3. Sheree-Ann Virgin
- 4. Joseph Siman
- 5. Ella Andrews
- 6. Lily Smith
- 7. Lucie Carey
- 8. Becky Loud
- 9. Matthew Wild (not admitted in England and Wales. Admitted in New York, Washington, DC and the United States Districts Courts for the Southern, Eastern, and Western Districts of New York, the Northern District of Illinois, the Eastern District of Michigan, the Eastern District of Wisconsin, and the United States Court of Appeals for the 6th Circuit)

#### Counsel

- 10. Charles Hollander QC (Brick Court Chambers)
- 11. David Went (Exchange Chambers)

Govia Thameslink Railway Limited, The Go-Ahead Group plc and Keolis (UK) Limited

#### **Solicitors**

- 1. Mark Sansom
- 2. Nicholas Frey
- 3. Jessica Steele
- 4. Angus Reston

- 5. Lydia Ream
- 6. Amy Sanderson
- 7. Dwayne Thompson
- 8. Seji Choi

(All of Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer LLP)

## Counsel

- 1. Paul Harris QC
- 2. Anneliese Blackwood
- 3. Michael Armitage
- 4. Cliodhna Kelleher

(All of Monckton Chambers)

## The Secretary of State for Transport

## **External Solicitors**

- 1. Lesley Farrell
- 2. Elizabeth Coleman
- 3. Deborah Polden
- 4. Anne Harris
- 5. Agnes Koko
- 6. Marc Lasok-Smith
- 7. Nick Brittlebank (trainee solicitor)

(All of Eversheds Sutherland (International) LLP)

# Counsel

- 5. Anneli Howard QC
- 6. Brendan McGurk

(Of Monckton Chambers)

# Department for Transport Legal Advisers, Government Legal Department

- 1. Jessica Walters
- 2. Ifeoma Nwabude
- 3. Henry Forrester
- 4. Jon Tan (trainee solicitor)

(All of the Department for Transport)

# PART B

# UNDERTAKING

- 2. Save in respect of provision to the Tribunal, I will not disclose the Confidential Information (as defined in the Tribunal's Order) to any person who is not a Relevant Adviser (as defined in the Tribunal's Order) without the express written consent of the person who originally disclosed the Confidential Information ("the **Disclosing Person**") or the permission of the Tribunal.
- 3. I will use the Confidential Information only for the purpose of these proceedings and for the purpose of no other current or future proceedings, dispute, complaint, or other use whatsoever without the express consent of the Disclosing Person.
- 4. I have read, and understand the implications of, Rule 102 of the Tribunal Rules, and will use the Confidential Information only in accordance with that Rule.
- 5. The Relevant Documents (as defined in the Tribunal's Order) containing the Confidential Information will remain in my custody or the custody of another Relevant Adviser at all times and be held in a manner appropriate to the circumstances so as to prevent unauthorised access or disclosure.
- 6. The production of further copies by me of the Relevant Documents containing the Confidential Information shall be limited to those required for the use of the Relevant Advisers for the purposes of these proceedings and shall be held in accordance with paragraph 5 of this undertaking.
- 7. With the exception of solicitors' or counsels' notes, and to the extent permitted by law or any applicable professional conduct regulations, any and all copies of the documents containing the Confidential Information will be securely disposed of insofar as is technologically possible or rendered inaccessible from any

computer systems, disk or device so that the Confidential Information is not readily available to any person at the conclusion of these proceedings.

- 8. None of the requirements in this undertaking shall prevent disclosure of any Confidential Information to any administrative, IT, or support staff for the purposes of fulfilling my instructions in the context of these proceedings.
- 9. The present proceedings for these purposes shall include any further appeals from the Tribunal to a higher court and/or any references to the European Courts, save insofar as that higher court orders otherwise.
- 10. Save that none of the requirements listed at paragraphs 2 to 7 above shall prevent Relevant Advisers from disclosing Confidential Information to persons who have already legitimately seen it.

Name:....

Signed:....

Date:....